

"I kept telling myself I have to learn; it is good for me and my children": Motherhood, motivation and learning English amongst a group of Pakistani British women.

RASOOL, Zanib and HACKETT, Abigail

Available from Sheffield Hallam University Research Archive (SHURA) at:

<http://shura.shu.ac.uk/33879/>

This document is the author deposited version. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite from it.

Published version

RASOOL, Zanib and HACKETT, Abigail (2024). "I kept telling myself I have to learn; it is good for me and my children": Motherhood, motivation and learning English amongst a group of Pakistani British women. TESOL Journal: e849.

Copyright and re-use policy

See <http://shura.shu.ac.uk/information.html>

"I kept telling myself I have to learn; it is good for me and my children": Motherhood, motivation and learning English amongst a group of Pakistani British women.

Zanib Rasool and Abigail Hackett

Paper accepted by *TESOL* in 2024. NB This is the author final copy of the manuscript, prior to copyediting and typesetting by the journal. The final published version will contain minor typographic changes and correct pagination. If you wish to quote from the paper, please access the final PDF version via the journal website: [TESOL Journal - Wiley Online Library](#)

Abstract

This paper focuses on Pakistani British Muslim female ESOL learners and their motivation to learn English by exploring through an Islamic lens and addressing the question, What are the identities, aspirations, and motivations for Pakistani and Muslim female ESOL learners? As Muslim women, the research participants had a strong allegiance to motherhood, with children being a motivating factor in learning English. This research explains how motherhood identities and the Islamic faith intersect in powerful ways for Pakistani British women learning English in the UK, and the specificities of how this identity is conceptualised through the Islamic faith can be invisible to educational institutions and policymakers. This study offers an alternative narrative by directly engaging with women's lived experiences as language learners and as Muslim women and mothers, thus contributing knowledge from the learner's perspective, whose voices are often not heard in English language debates.

Whilst research has demonstrated the importance of a desire to help one's children as a motivation for ESOL learners, this paper adds to the scholarship by demonstrating how motherhood identities and Islamic faith intersect in powerful ways for Pakistani British women learning English in the UK. Through long-term qualitative fieldwork with Pakistani British women learning English, my research explored the question; What are the identities, aspirations, and motivations of Pakistani and Muslim female ESOL learners? As Muslim women, my research participants had a strong allegiance to motherhood. This identity, and

the specificities of how this identity is conceptualised through the Islamic faith, can be invisible to education institutions and policymakers.

As this paper will illustrate, the role of the mother within Islam is particularly respected. The Holy Prophet (PBHU) emphasised the love and respect due to a mother by saying, "Paradise lies at the feet of the mother." Together with this status is a role and responsibility to teach children and support them in accessing the moral values of Islam. Muslim identities argue Khan and Mythen (2019, 2020), are maintained and negotiated in everyday routines. At the same time, Muslim beliefs, values, and aspirations are questioned in the political sphere. My study offers an alternative narrative by directly engaging with women's lived experiences as language learners and as Muslim women. The implications for educators include the importance of seeing beyond a homogenous 'ESOL' learner identity and recognising how other 'translocation' (Khan, 2022) identities create motivation and rationale for Pakistani British Muslim women to invest in learning a new language.

Motherhood and ESOL learner identities

The women in my study had "inter commonality" (Hussain, 2021) identities as mothers that bonded them. A well-established source of literature highlights that for some women, being a mother can increase motivation and aspirations to learn the English language (Allan, 2015; Elmore, 2017; Sidaway, 2021; Swinney, 2017). For example, Norton (2000) found that learning English was an investment for migrant women and linked to their gender identities. She refers to Rockhill's (1987) study on Hispanic immigrant women, who talked about literacy in the context of family rather than as an individual right since success was measured to the extent their children and husbands were successful. Burns (2002) explored the experiences of migrant ESOL learners through narrative stories and found the importance of learning English stemmed from the desire to provide for their families; they had family goals as well as individual aspirations. Jouili and Amir-Moazami (2006) point out that a good, educated woman can mean a good, educated mother. Graham-Brown (2020), in her study, found that one of the main places of social interaction for ESOL female learners was the school or nursery, "school gate," and involved small talk with other mothers, and interaction with teachers. The mundane everyday routine of taking your child to school can build the confidence of young mothers. Park (2011) listened to the stories of English language learners in the United States, who mentioned that learning English meant parents maintained their relationship with their children, for whom English became the dominant language. In these ways, English language learning can become "a crucial part of mothering identity" (Park, 2011, p. 165).

The above scholarship points to the complexity of learner identities, identifying the importance of motherhood, family and community for many different ESOL learners. ESOL learners are not a homogeneous group; they come from different countries and cultures and hold different world views (Husserl, 1970). My research builds on this literature by focusing on the Islamic identity of motherhood, which inspired women in my study to access language classes. This paper provides a rich, insider understanding through the stories of a particular group of Pakistani British women's motivations as language learners. Muslim women's lives are fluid and changing, and we need up-to-date studies to understand their different learning practices and aspirations.

Muslim identities and adult learning beyond a white lens

Khan (2022) argues that there has been a systematic "othering" of Muslims in European imaginery for the last two decades, coupled with ongoing anxieties about integration and assimilation (Layton-Henry, 1992; Stopes-Roe and Cochrane, 1990). Aziz (2012) describes how Muslim women find themselves "trapped at the intersection of race, religion, and gender and suffer in silence" (p. 236) and struggle to move beyond their ascribed labels. Gandhi (1998) argues that "she is simply the medium through which competing discourses represent their claim" (p. 90), as no one directly speaks to her about her aspirations as a language learner. This causes injustice to Muslims women, as learners and as citizens, an injustice that permeates through language policymaking and into the classroom.

Postcolonial feminist writers from the global South, like Abu-Lughod (2013), Mohanty (2006), and Spivak (1988), challenge the supposed binary between Eastern oppression and Western freedom. Through its concern with how the Western world's representation distorts the experiences and realities of women from once colonised countries (Tyagi, 2014), postcolonial feminist theory offers a response to the othering of Muslim women learners. My research directly listens to the voices of ESOL learners who also happen to be mothers and challenges their subaltern positions in white societies. As I will go on to demonstrate, my participants, through their stories, offer a positive alternative to the dominant representations of Muslim women, who are seen as a "negative female ideal" (Khaf, 1999, p. 7), with Islam viewed as an oppressive, patriarchal religion. Key to this counter narrative is the need to resist viewing the mothering and learning practices of my participants through a white lens.

Writing about the experiences of Black women in the workplace, Rabelo et al. (2021) describe the effect of the white lens as scrutiny against "a sharp white background" (p. 1840) that takes certain practices for granted while erasing others. While treating certain practices as universal

or natural, the white gaze, defined as “a set of practices that communicates whiteness and reinforces white supremacy,” can “render Black women as “guests or strangers in white spaces” (Rabelo et al., 2021, p. 1843). Considering the specificity of British Pakistani women’s motivations for learning English, as I do in this paper, is essential in order that they are not rendered “guests or strangers” in the ESOL classroom. In particular, understanding the intersection of mother identity and Islamic faith for these British Pakistani women disrupts a narrative about parental identity and learning motivation in which a white lens is imposed (assumed universal), presumed (taken for granted), and venerated (valued and preferred) (Rabelo et al, 2021).

Methodology

My first study cohort was eight Pakistani women, former ESOL learners whom I met as a community development worker in ESOL classes at a community center where I worked in the 1980s. Through stories of their journeys over the ensuing years, the women described the impact of learning the English language, including what motivated them (Rasool, 2022). My research also involved a second group of ten new Pakistani female learners wanting to learn English who were accessing the ‘Life in the UK’ course to prepare for the British citizenship test. The women were all from the Punjab, Jammu, and Kashmir regions of Pakistan, mainly villages. All the participants were mothers, and some were grandmothers. I obtained consent and made sure the women knew they could withdraw it at any time.

I am a British-born Muslim woman of Pakistani heritage; my knowledge mainly comes from the Western education system and my Islamic faith. I shared with my participants the diaspora Pakistani history as a daughter of immigrants, a rich culture, a heritage language, and the Islamic faith. Kinship bonds unite us, making me a cultural insider. As an insider researcher, I understand the Islamic context of motherhood. Knowing some of the older women, some of the women agreed to take part because of our long-term connection. They knew me and trusted me, which added pressure to do justice to their stories. I did not know the new ESOL learners personally, but they knew of me through their family members, who endorsed me as trustworthy for having supported Pakistani women for a number of years.

Some of my experiences overlapped with those of the participants, such as the everyday microaggressions we face as Muslim women, something I became aware of when I was listening to their stories, so I kept reflective notes to keep track of my own reality. There is an educational gap between me and some of my participants, which I was mindful of in our interactions. There are also challenges to being an insider researcher. I am an unmarried

woman with no children, and sometimes there was some tension with the older participants about my choice, and I became an outsider within the realm of motherhood.

To engage with Pakistani women as language learners and understand their barriers and motivations, I drew on storytelling (Barkhuizen, 2019; McKittrick, 2021; Yuval-David, 2010) as a method that offered me a wide holistic lens to explore “the actual nature, shape and quality of their motivation while this may be pulled, shaped and remodeled by various socio-cultural, emotional, historical and psychological forces embedded within the person’s life capital and their field(s) of play (or contexts)” (Consoli, S. 2021a, p. 124). Motherhood was embedded in the women’s emotions and social-cultural norms. Some interviews were conducted in the participants’ homes, where the role of the mother became more powerful, with children’s photos and grandchildren’s toys scattered around the room. Through a storytelling approach, I was able to gain a deeper insight into the realities of Muslim mothers learning the English language. Barkhuizen (2019) argues that “small stories are snippets of often mundane talk in conversations” (p.100), allowing storytellers to construct their identities. Stories of individual life trajectories according to Consoli (2022) promote a “fresh perspective on our research—a lens which, in the long run, may yield TESOL research that fully acknowledges, values, and celebrates the humanness of our inquiries” (p.1), acknowledging different world views and life experiences, histories, beliefs of our learners.

I adopted Braun and Clarke’s (2006) framework to code my initial data, selecting key primary concepts from Braun and Clarke’s thematic analysis, such as identity, agency, independence, and aspirations, to frame the findings. I brought together all the key emerging concepts from the first round of coding and applied them to the second round of coding, adopting Miles et al.’s (2020) model that created patterns and theoretical constructs highlighting gender inequality and power.

Sources of power and agency

Through their stories, my research participants defined their own sources of power (Islam) and agency (children). The women in my research were strongly motivated to learn English, stressing that English was important to function in daily life, especially when talking to their children’s teachers and helping them with homework. One of my participants, Sharaz, speaks for most of my research participants when she says,

You cannot live in a country without knowing its language. It is hard now to just get by. (1980s learner, Sharaz, March 2018).

During our conversations, the women referred to the Quran and the Hadith¹ as their major sources of moral guidance and as points of religious reference. The women stressed their Islamic duty to seek knowledge. The Messenger of Allah (PBUH) said, "Whoever takes a path upon which to obtain knowledge, Allah makes the path to paradise easy for them" (Shah and Farooq, 2022, p. 55). I interpret this to mean all knowledge systems.

My research participants challenged, through their stories, the postcolonial trajectory of Muslim women in Western representation as victims of Islam and patriarchy. The women's accounts provided a counter-narrative to the way Global Majority women are frequently storied as powerless victims (Mohanty, 2006), held back by men in their communities (Cameron, 2016a), and prevented from accessing learning so they don't know their rights. In fact, most of the women said the opposite about the support they received from male family members, like Sara, who talks about her father supporting her.

My father wanted me to learn English. He really encouraged me to learn English, saying, "In this country, you need to know English." I first started learning English with a teacher called Christine. She was a volunteer teacher, and I could read but was shy to speak. I used to go to the multicultural centre English classes twice a week. I was attending a full week of classes. Wherever there were classes, I went. (1980s learner, Sara, April 2018).

The role of motherhood and grandmotherhood

I first met Henna in the 1980s. Her interview took place in February 2018, where she explained that an opportunity arose when her children started school, to practise her English by volunteering and building her own confidence.

I had to keep telling myself, "I have to learn; it's good for me and for my children as well". When my children started going to school, they used to have "book days," where you went into the school and listened to children read, or you read a book to them and asked them questions. It was called "Better Reading."

¹ The Hadith is the record of the sayings of Prophet Muhammad (swas), a collection of books that serve as guidelines for the Islamic religion.

Henna talks about learning for herself (learner identity) and for her children (mother identity). Learning a language can be isolating, and Henna sought out an environment to practise her English where she felt comfortable.

The desire to learn is mentioned by another ESOL learner who accessed English classes so she could visit her doctor independently and then progressed on to family learning courses and phonics delivered in her children's school to help them. Sharaz says:

I needed to gain confidence and motivate myself to attend classes as I needed to learn English to go to the doctor on my own. When my children started school, I went on family learning courses and did lots of courses at their school so I could help my children. I translated stories from English into Urdu. For two years, I attended various literacy classes to assist my children's learning, including story-sack-making, numeracy, and phonics (1980s learner, Sharaz, March 2018).

Often, Pakistani women told their stories through their children and grandchildren as a way of framing their lives. Henna mentions, as a grandmother, how she finds social media a useful way of communicating with her grandchildren and how it motivates her to learn to use technology.

I can use social media, a computer, the internet, text, WhatsApp, Snapchat, Facebook, you name it. When my granddaughters go to nursery, their parents send me their photos, and I have to text them and say they are "looking pretty" (1980s learner, Henna, February 2018).

All the women participating in my research centred on the mother role when describing how and why they accessed ESOL. They justified their search for knowledge in a gendered way, linking it to motherhood and saying that their learning was also good for them and their children. As described above, for many Muslims, the Quran and Hadith lay down normative expectations of motherhood. Khan and Mythen (2019, 2020) argue that "Islamic scriptures provide a solid platform from which to subvert the everyday rehearsal of normative discourses" (p. 319). During our discussions about language learning, the women brought their mother roles into our conversation, and the older women repeatedly mentioned their mother status.

The motivation for my participants was specifically linked to the Islamic view of motherhood, including its centrality, value and responsibilities. In our conversations, the mothers referred to their duty and responsibility, which included their children learning about Islam to guide

them, and mothers like Henna studied Islam to gain more knowledge to pass on to the next generation. Gupta (2021) argues that "motivation is an internal force. It cannot be measured in quantitative terms" (p. 1597). Henna's motivation came from Islam, which elevates the position of a woman when she becomes a mother (Rizvi, 2021). Islam was a source of empowerment and personal autonomy for this group of women, providing them with a sense of self-worth (Covington, 1984) in their role as mothers. For example, in the Hadith, it is mentioned when asked by a man who should he be kind to, "to your mother." and when asked the second time again, said: "to your mother". He was asked a third time again, the answer was: "your mother" Once again asked for the fourth time: "your father". The significant responsibility and respect Islam gives to the mother was also connected to jannah (aspiring for a place in paradise), through my research participants' belief that if they performed in a certain manner as mothers, their efforts would be rewarded in the next life.

Muslim women's piety can be understood as a form of agency (Sehlikoglu, 2018) and "ethical self-making" (Mahmood, 2011). By this I mean, piety, including knowledge seeking, leads to both internal validation and external recognition within the community. Over time, pious, knowledgeable women become sought out as sources of advice and support, with a growing recognition and respect within the community.

Implications and conclusions

The voices of women British Pakistani ESOL learners in my study are clear: they wanted to learn English, and a key motivating factor was that not being able to speak that language would impact their children's life chances. The women gave me access to their religious lives and offered a different perspective. Within their Islamic faith, motherhood is a space of agency, respect and responsibility, with a specific focus on gaining knowledge for oneself and one's children. Thus, both religion and motherhood and the intersection between the two gave motivation to my participants. A thread weaves through the women's stories about motherhood and learning English so they could help their children, as well as the importance of these roles according to Islam.

When entering an ESOL class, Muslim women often lose that confidence and self-esteem, feeling alienated in a new environment. Educators must find ways to sustain their confidence in the classroom. For example, one of the local organisations working with women ESOL learners described how they worked from an Islamic perspective to empower and engage women in learning.

We looked at bringing the women out through faith. In the Quran, it says, "You are never too old to learn." Islam encourages the gaining of knowledge. I use Islam as a vehicle to reach these women and talk to their families. I set up a prayer group as a vehicle to get the women to come and build their interest. For me, it was getting their interest and motivation, choosing something they really wanted, and knowing what rights they have under Islam. (Learning support organisation, Manager, May 2018).

Educators and others who support English language learners should keep an open mind, as statements by politicians do not always reflect the realities of Muslim women's lives in contemporary Britain. Muslim women have the right in Islam to educate themselves and seek knowledge and it is obligatory for both men and women. "Islam encourages its followers to enlighten themselves with the knowledge of their religion as well as other branches of knowledge" (Jawad, 1998, p. 16). All the women in my study were aware of their rights in Islam and felt empowered and relied on the Islamic text to advocate their right to seek knowledge and to access ESOL and other forms of learning.

While the women learned English at the organisation quoted above, they also increased Islamic knowledge of women's rights, delivered from a woman's perspective rather than by male Imams. This involved, for example, revisiting the original texts of the Quran and the Hadith and discussing the interpretations as they pertain to childhood, knowledge, and the role of the mother. The Prophet Muhammad (PBUH) said: "Seeking knowledge is an obligation for every Muslim" (Muneer, 2014, p. 10). Today, women learners are part of the production of Islamic knowledge in their community and share that knowledge to empower each other

Learner identities impact classroom practices (Richards, 2021). Cooke (2006) argues that "knowing more about learners and their "various worlds and experiences" helps us understand which factors influence their English language learning" (p. 57) to shape a relevant pedagogy. Therefore, ESOL teachers have a role to play in supporting motivating identities and making learning relevant. Teachers need to understand what motivates their learners, since what motivates them may not be what is taught in English language classes (Badwan, 2017), creating a disconnect between their aspirations and motivation and the curriculum delivered. Badwan (2017) mentions the divide between second language learners' "ideal selves" and "real selves" (p. 196). Education is a powerful tool to raise the aspirations of women like my research participants to be their "best selves."

When women from former British colonies in South Asia arrive in England, there is a heightened expectation that they learn the English language and integrate into British society. Neelam (2022) argues that the politicisation of Muslims in the West means they are under increased scrutiny: "Muslim women [...] are made hyper-visible" (p. 27) and "depicted as victims of violence and oppression" (p. 25) and living parallel lives (Cattle, 2001). Muslim women are showered with Western empathy without real knowledge of their lives. One organisation in my study, which was set up in the 1980s and has supported women language learners for the last 40 years, strongly advocates that women want to learn English and are motivated:

Women are motivated and want to learn English. I don't agree with what politicians say: that minority women don't want to learn English or integrate. If you show respect to them and have a tutor who is not criticising them, it builds their confidence and trust. We had 40 to 50 women coming here a week, and they were motivated to learn. (BAME training organisation manager, April 2018).

Muslim women are among the most scrutinised groups of ESOL learners; the English language has become a tool to subjugate them, with little understanding of what motivates women. Negative stereotypes follow them into English language classes. Thus, it is crucial for educators to go beyond seeing women like my research participants as just ESOL students; they are mothers, religious beings, and have lived knowledge. We must not look at Muslim women's lives through a white gaze (Pailey, 2020). Educators have an ethical duty to understand more about the lives of British Pakistani Muslim women, which are oversimplified by the dichotomy of victimhood and the need for Western intervention to liberate docile bodies (Foucault, 1979).

According to Noormohamed (2008), new identities for Muslim women are emerging as educated and politically engaged. Lieblich et al. (1998) argue that "stories provide coherence and consistency to one's experience" (p. 7). The stories the women in my study shared with me challenge outdated labels and stereotypes, and illuminate identities and roles that empowered them. In particular, the consistent message was that motivation comes partly down to their roles as mothers, and that this role of motherhood is highlighted through an Islamic lens.

References

- Abu-Lughod, L. (2013). *Do Muslim women need saving?* Harvard University Press.
- Allan, M. (2015). *Migrant ESOL Learners: a Foucauldian Discourse Analysis*. Doctorate thesis. The University of Stirling. Available on: <https://storre.stir.ac.uk/bitstream/1893/22335/1/Margaret%20Allan%20EdDThesis%202015.pdf>
- Aziz, S. F. (2012). From the Oppressed to the Terrorist: Muslim-American Women in the Crosshairs of Intersectionality. *Hastings Race and Poverty Law Journal*, 9, 191-264. Available on: https://papers.ssrn.com/sol3/papers.cfm?abstract_id=1981777.
- Badwan, K. M. (2017). "Did we learn English or what?": A study abroad student in the UK carrying and crossing boundaries in out-of-class communication. *Studies in Second Language Learning and Teaching*, 7 (2), 193-210. doi: 10.14746/ssl.2017.7.2.2
- Barkhuizen, G. (2019). Narrative knowledging in Second Language Teaching and Learning Context. In: A. De Fina, and A. Georgakopoulou, (Eds.), *The Handbook of Narrative Analysis*. (pp. 97-117) Wiley Blackwell.
- Braun, V., & Clarke. V. (2006). Using Thematic Analysis in Psychology. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 3 (2), 77-101. DOI:10.1191/1478088706qp063oa
- Burns, M. (2022). *The voices of ESOL: A narrative discovery of "what the learning experiences of students attending ESOL classes in a further education college in the North East of Ireland"?* Centre for Education and Lifelong Learning. Master of Arts in Educational Practice. National College of Ireland.
- Cameron, D. (2016a, January 18th). We won't let women be second class citizens. Forcing all migrants to learn English and ending gender segregation will show we're serious about creating One Nation. *The Times*. Available on: <https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/wewont-let-women-be-second-class-citizens-brh07l6jttb>
- Cantle, T. (2001). *Community cohesion: A report of the Independent Review Team*. London: Home Office. Available on: <https://dera.ioe.ac.uk/14146/1/communitycohesionreport.pdf>.
- Consoli, S. (2022). Life Capital: An Epistemic and Methodological Lens for TESOL Research. *TESOL Quarterly*, 56, (4), 1397-1409. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesq.3154>
- Consoli, S. (2021a). Understanding motivation through ecological research: The case of exploratory practice. In R. Sampson & R. Pinner (Eds.), *Complexity perspectives on researching language learner and teacher psychology*. (pp. 180-135), *Multilingual Matters*.
- Cooke, M. (2006). "When I wake up I dream of electricity": The lives, aspirations and 'needs' of Adult ESOL learners. *Linguistics and Education*, 17, (1), 56-73. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.linged.2006.08.010>
- Covington, M.V. (1984). The Self-Worth Theory of Achievement Motivation: Findings and Implications. *The Elementary School Journal*, 85 (1), 5-20. <https://doi.org/10.1086/461388>

- Elmore, J. (2017). *Information Sharing in ESOL Classes: People, Objects, and Places*. Ph.D. Thesis. The University of Sheffield. Available on:
<http://etheses.whiterose.ac.uk/20026/8/Elmore%20PhD%20thesis%20.pdf>.
- Foucault, M. (1979). *Discipline and Punish: The Birth of the Prison*. (Sheridan, A. Trans.). Penguin Book Limited..
- Gandhi, L. (1998). *Postcolonial Theory: A Critical Introduction*. Allen & Unwin.
- Goffman, E. (1976). Gender display. *Studies in the Anthropology of Visual Communication*, 3, 69-77.
- Graham-Brown, N. (2020). *Belonging: A study of the relationship between migrant women's social interactions and their perception of their own integration*. Doctoral thesis (EdD), UCL (University College London). Available on <https://discovery.ucl.ac.uk/id/eprint/10096150/>
- Gupta, A.K. (2021). Motivation Theories and their Application. International. *Journal of Science and Research*, 10, (3), 1597-1600. <https://doi.org/10.21275/SR21323110051>
- Husserl, E. (1970). *The Crisis of European Sciences and Transcendental Phenomenology*, Northwest University Press
- Hussain, S. (2021). Ethnicity desegregation and 'resignation' in northern English schools. *Ethnicities*, 22(6), 1-22. . <https://doi.org/10.1177/146879682110440>
- Jawad, H.A. (1998). *Islam and Women's Education*. In: *The Rights of Women in Islam*. Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1057/9780230503311_2
- Jouili, J. S. & Amir-Moazami, S. (2006). Knowledge, Empowerment and Religious Authority Among Pious Muslim Women in France and Germany. *The Muslim World*, 96, (4), 617-642. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1478-1913.2006.00150.x>
- Khaf, M. (1999). *Western Representations of the Muslim Woman: From Termagant to Odalisque*. University of Texas Press.
- Khan, F. (2022). Relocating the veil: the everyday lives of young hijabi Britons under ideological culturalism. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 45 (16), 501-522, DOI <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2022.2105656>
- Khan, F. and Mythen, G. (2020). Performing Hybridity or Deflecting Islamophobia? Adaptable Identity Management amongst Young British Pakistani Muslims. *Social Sciences*, 10 (12), 1-16 <https://doi.org/10.3390/socsci10120449>
- Khan, F. and Mythen, G. (2019). 'Micro Level Management of Islamophobia: Negotiation, Deflection and Resistance'. In I. Awan, & I. Zempi (Eds.), *The Routledge International Handbook of Islamophobia* (pp. 313-324). Routledge.
- Layton-Henry, Z. (1992). *The Politics of Immigration: 'Race' and 'Race' Relations in Post-War Britain*. (Making Contemporary Britain). Blackwell.

- Leiblich, A., Tuval-Mashiach., R., & Zilber, T. (1998). *Narrative research: Reading, analysis, and interpretation*. Sage.
- Mahmood, S. (2011). *Politics of piety: The Islamic revival and the feminist subject*. Princeton University Press.
- McKittrick, K. (2021). *Dear Science and Other Stories*. Duke University Press.
- Miles, M.B., Huberman., A. M., Saldana, J. (2020). *Qualitative Data Analysis: A Methods Sourcebook*. 4th ed. Sage Publications Ltd.
- Mohanty, C.T. (2006). Under Western Eyes: Feminist Scholarship and Colonial *Discourses*: In. A. Ashcroft, G. Griffiths, H. Tiffin, (Eds.), *The Post-Colonial Reader* (pp.242-245). Routledge.
- Muneer, M.J. (2014). *Forty Hadith on Seeking Knowledge*. Gloucestershire, U.K.. Inkpot Publishing Ltd.
<https://ia601002.us.archive.org/24/items/40HadithSeekingKnowledgeMuftiMuhammadibnMuneer/40HadithSeekingKnowledge-MuftiMuhammadibnMuneer.pdf>
- Neelam, M. (2002). *Muslim Women as Speakers of English*. Palgrave Macmillan
- Norton, B. (2000). *Identity and Language Learning, Gender, Ethnicity and Educational Change*. Pearson Education Limited.
- Noormohamed, N.A. (2008). Muslim women - Adapting culture to the modern Western world. *Journal of Diversity Management*, 3 (1), 67-73. <https://doi.org/10.19030/jdm.v3i1.4982>
- Pailey, R.N. (2019). De-centring the 'White Gaze' of Development. *Development and Change*, 51, (3), 729-745. <https://doi.org/10.1111/dech.12550>.
- Park, G. (2011). Adult English language learners constructing and sharing their stories and experiences: The cultural and linguistic autobiography writing project. *TESOL Journal*, 2 (2). 156-172. <https://doi.org/10.5054/tj.2011.250378>
- Rabelo, V. Robotham, K. and McCluney, C. (2021). "Against a sharp white background": How Black women experience the white gaze at work. *Gender, Work and Organisation*, 28 (5), 1840-1858.
- Rasool, Zanib (2022). *The Empowerment of Pakistani Muslim Women Through Diverse Funds of Knowledge, Language, and Literacy Practices: A Study Undertaken in Rotherham Exploring English Language Learning from the 1980s to 2020*. EdD thesis, University of Sheffield.
- Richards, J.C. (2021). Teacher, Learner and Student-Teacher Identity in TESOL. *RELC Journal*. 54 (1), 1 –15. DOI: 10.1177/0033688221991308.
- Rizvi, S. (2021). *Undoing Whiteness in Disability Studies: The Special Education System and British South Asian Mothers*. Palgrave MacMillan.

- Rockhill, K. (1987). Literacy as threat/desire: Longing to be SOMEBODY. In J. Gaskill and A. McLaren (Eds.), *Women and Education: A Canadian Perspective*. (pp. 315–31) Detselig Enterprises Ltd.
- Sehlikoglu, S. (2018). Revisited: Muslim women's agency and feminist anthropology of the Middle East. *Contemporary Islam*, 12 (1) 73-92. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11562-017-0404-8>.
- Shah, M. S. and Farooq, A. (2022). *Islamic Teaching and Social Structure: Convictions and Contradictions*. Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Sidaway, K. (2021). Exploring the motivation of women studying in a multilevel ESOL class in England. *TESOL Journal*, 13 (1), 1-18. <https://doi.org/10.1002/tesj.615>.
- Spivak, G.C. (1988). *Can the Subaltern Speak?* MacMillan.
- Stopes-Roe, M., & Cochrane, R. (1990). *Citizens of this Country: The Asian British*. Multilingual Matters Ltd.
- Swinney, K. (2017). *English Language Provision and Community Networks. A Collaborative Study*. PhD. Thesis. Sheffield University. Available on:
<http://etheses.whiterose.ac.uk/19311/1/Thesis%2031stJanuary2018.pdf>
- Tyagi, R. (2014). Understanding postcolonial feminism in relation with postcolonial and feminist theories. *International Journal of Language and Linguistics*, 1 (2), 45-50.
- Yuval-Davis, N. (2010). Theorizing identity: beyond the 'us' and 'them' dichotomy. *Patterns of Prejudice*, 44(3), 261-280. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0031322X.2010.489736>