Enacting social transformation through occupation: A narrative literature review

CUNNINGHAM, M, WARREN, A, POLLARD, Nicholas <http://orcid.org/0000-0003-1995-6902> and ABYEY, S

Available from Sheffield Hallam University Research Archive (SHURA) at:
http://shura.shu.ac.uk/27706/

This document is the author deposited version. You are advised to consult the publisher's version if you wish to cite from it.

Published version


Copyright and re-use policy

See http://shura.shu.ac.uk/information.html
Enacting social transformation through arts-based occupations: A literature review

Miranda Cunningham**, Dr. A. Warren^{b}, Dr. N. Pollard^{c} and Dr. S. Abey^{d}

^{a}School of Health Professions, University of Plymouth, Plymouth, United Kingdom;^{b}School of Health Professions, University of Plymouth, Plymouth, United Kingdom;^{c}XXXXX, Sheffield Hallam University, Sheffield, United Kingdom;^{d}School of Health Professions, University of Plymouth, Plymouth, United Kingdom

**Miranda Cunningham, School of Health Professions, Faculty of Health: Medicine, Dentistry and Human Sciences, University of Plymouth, SF12 PAHC, Derriford Road, Plymouth. miranda.cunningham@plymouth.ac.uk 01752 588810

Commented [AW1]: If relevant you might want to add Doctoral Candidate- we need to check the correct term from the Doctoral college guidelines.
Enacting social transformation through arts-based occupations: A literature review

Background: In the fields of occupational therapy and occupational science there has been a drive to confront social and health injustices through occupation-based practices with social transformation as a key goal. However, there is an acknowledged lack of theory and strategies to support this developing area of practice. Aim: To explore how arts-based occupations have been used to enact social transformation for disadvantaged communities and to delineate socially transformative outcomes. Methods: A narrative literature review was carried out using seven databases. Thirty one items published in English, written between 2003-2019 were included. Results: Three broad themes emerged from the analysis: personal transformation and giving voice; aspirations towards social transformation; and using occupations for social change. Conclusions: The literature reviewed suggests that whilst personal change and small scale social change outcomes are achievable through arts-based practices, structural change is not likely to be reported. Discussion of how change came about or why change occurred was not always evident. There is a need for further exploration of the mechanisms and contexts supporting change to inform future practice in the growing field of occupation-based social transformation.

Keywords: social transformation, occupation, social change, arts-based

Introduction

Evidence suggests that global health and social inequalities are increasing (1-3). Health inequalities are known to be socially determined and arise from discrimination and lack of access to resources such as economic, education or housing (4-6). Despite advances in medicine and health care, health inequalities persist and are evident between and within nations (6). Globally, there are calls to action to bring about change to improve the lives of populations, including through the United Nations Sustainable Development Goals (7) and action on the social determinants of health (8).
Acknowledgement of a moral responsibility amongst health and social care professionals to develop transformative practice and act on social injustices is also evident, for example in nursing (9), dietetics (10), medicine (11), and social work (12). This call for social transformation has been echoed in occupational science and occupational therapy (13).

It was Elizabeth Townsend, in the context of 1990s Canada, who first wrote about social transformation in relation to occupation. In her paper she discussed personal and social transformation and suggested an emancipatory element to support equity and justice for disadvantaged communities (14). An orientation to social and occupational justice is evident elsewhere (15, 16) as well as addressing socio-political conditions that create or maintain injustices (17). Arguably, this has been the case for many years for occupational therapists practising in the Global South. In Brazil, for example, occupational therapists have been working in the ‘social field’ since the 1970s (18), and in South Africa, Watson’s and Swartz’s seminal 2004 text ‘Transformation through Occupation’ (19) documented a number of case studies where occupational therapists had been working with communities in the context of poverty and rapid social change. Practitioners have drawn on the works of radical philosophers and social theorists such as Paulo Freire, a Brazilian critical educator who developed the idea of critical consciousness (20), Antonio Gramsci, who gave the world theories of the state and hegemonic power (21), and Pierre Bourdieu who theorised about power in society and developed the concept of habitus, described as the cultural embodiment of power (22). In addition, acknowledgement of alternative ways of knowing, proposed by contemporary scholars such as Boaventura De Sousa Santos have been utilised to liberate practitioners from purely individualistic, rehabilitative paradigms, to focus on ideas of ‘buen vivir’, or good living, which centre on communality, respect for mother
There is a lack of clarity however, regarding the term ‘social transformation’ within the occupation-based literature. Farias et al., (15) have recently provided a definition of social transformation related to the use of occupation, suggesting that it is a process denoted by knowledge and practice developed to build a just society in partnership with people experiencing systematic disadvantage. The occupation-based literature does not suggest an understanding of social transformation to the extent described in the broader social science literature, where social transformation is unplanned and unprecedented change brought about through deep shifts in some aspect of society [24-26]. In fact, the term ‘social transformation’ is used interchangeably at times in the occupation-based literature with the term ‘social change’, see for example (15, 17, 27). Some occupational therapists, with experience in the social field, caution against thinking naively that it will be possible for occupational therapists to overcome social inequity at a structural level (28). Nevertheless, they encourage practitioners to work towards the promotion of social participation for those that are disadvantaged, as do an increasing number of occupational therapists and occupational scientists across the world (29-31).

It is evident that there are efforts to move understanding of occupation-based social transformation forward within occupational science and occupational therapy. Recently, an International Social Transformation Group through Occupation Network has been established which aims to grow research, practice and education in the field of occupation-based social transformation (32). The network are currently undertaking a research project using a qualitative case study design to ‘build understanding of the conditions required for social transformation and the role of occupation in this’ (32).
However, there is scope for further exploration and elucidation and the potential for diverse ontological understandings to contribute to growth in the field (33). To that end, this paper presents a narrative literature review designed to explore and describe the use of occupation-based practices to enact social changes for disadvantaged communities and to attempt to elucidate socially transformative outcomes.

A number of different forms of occupation have been used in attempts to enact social transformation, for example there is sport for development (34) and urban or guerrilla gardening (35). To provide focus for the review, arts-based occupations were targeted. There are a number of reasons why arts-based occupations are relevant to occupation-based social transformation including, firstly, the roots of occupational therapy and science lie in social activism allied to the arts (36) and occupational therapists have a long tradition in using arts as a therapeutic medium. The use in society of art-forms to support social movements has been asserted (37) and there is a tradition of using art-forms for resistance (38). Additionally, there is a growing interest in the use of arts for health (39) and the rise of gentle protest bringing craft and activism together, known as craftivism (40).

Material and method

A systematic methodology was employed to search, evaluate and synthesise the available literature on the use of arts-based occupations aimed at enacting social transformation using the following databases; CINAHL, AMED, MEDline, Arts and...
Searches were limited to peer reviewed journal articles from 2000 onwards and were undertaken in October 2019. The research question driving the review was: how can arts-based practices be used to bring about social transformation for people who are marginalised?

Search terms were identified, combining free text terms and Boolean operators and included for example: marginalised, disadvantaged, low income, social exclu* AND occupation-based, arts-based, creativ*, theatre, drama, dance, writing, photo*, video AND social transformati*, social change, transformati*, policy change, attitude change, development, chang*. Articles were screened according to inclusion criteria initially at the title and abstract level and then again at full text level. The inclusion criteria were that the articles should discuss the use of an arts-based occupational medium eg photography, theatre, dance or film and also discussion of attempts at social transformation or change, articles should be peer reviewed and in English. Exclusion criteria were that the article discussed research methods eg interviews or focus groups only, rather than an arts-based occupation and focused solely on individual development, without a link to broader social transformation. A manual search of the reference lists of included articles was also conducted. Searches yielded a total of 686 articles, of which 18 were eligible for inclusion in the narrative review. A hand search of reference lists revealed a further 13 additional articles, resulting in a final total of 31 included in this review.

Commented [AW40]: Why these databases?
Commented [AW41]: Why? Quality process?
Commented [SA42]: I might consider putting this information in a bulleted list form. It just makes it easier for the reader to pull out the information easily.
Commented [AW43]: Secondary searching.
Selection of articles

The PRISMA diagram (41) below has been used to support the transparency of this review and describes the selection of articles.

Records identified through database searching of title and abstracts (n = 686)

Records after duplicates removed (n = 590)

Records screened using title and abstract (n = 590)

Articles assessed for eligibility full-text (n = 30)

Studies included in qualitative synthesis (n = 31)

Records excluded (n = 560)

Full-text articles excluded did not meet inclusion criteria (n = 12)

Reference list search of included articles (n = 13)

Commented [SA44]: Did you have an data extraction sheet?
Overview of the literature

Table 1 lists the articles included with details of participants, the type of occupation used, the purpose of the article and a brief outline of changes described. The articles included participants from locations across six continents including: South America (37, 42-45), North America (46-55), Asia (56, 57), Africa (57-61), Australia/Oceania (62), and Europe (63-66).

Purpose and quality of the literature

The purpose of the articles varied. Only five articles described large scale arts-based interventions initiated primarily for social change, with the articles reporting evaluation subsequent to this (37, 42, 43, 54, 56). These included a discussion of the making of appliqued textile images called ‘arpilleras’ used to support change during the Pinochet regime (37). Another detailed Peruvian women’s protests against corrupt government using theatre and carnival (42). There was an evaluation of a Government initiated ‘social circus’ project designed to support national social change in Ecuador (43) and a smaller scale social circus programme in Quebec, Canada (54). Finally, there was a large quilting project in Hong Kong designed to support change related to marginalised female textile workers (56).

There were also a variety of literature reviews of photovoice and participatory digital methodologies (67-71); one was described as a scoping review (70), there was a critical methodological review (72), two literature reviews (68, 69) and a qualitative systematic review (71). Although the systematic review did not conform to expectations...
of a systematic review [including no PRISMA diagram and no indication of the quality of the papers was included].

A further eleven articles were author reflections on research or other projects (44, 45, 47, 49, 50, 55, 61-65). These were descriptive and did not provide adequate detail on research methods for them to be critically appraised. Ten further articles reported on the findings of research projects using photovoice or forum theatre (46, 48, 51-53, 57-60, 66). Photovoice is a participatory method designed originally by Wang and Burris (73) which uses participant photography specifically to promote critical dialogue and enact change through reaching policymakers (p. 369). Forum Theatre, which is part of a method called ‘Theatre of the Oppressed’, is based on the philosophy of Paulo Freire (20) and was developed by Augusto Boal in the 1970s (74). It is an interactive theatrical performance where the audience is invited to participate on stage. Potential solutions to political or social conflict can be problem solved and alternatives enacted in real-time (66, 75).

The quality of the research articles was assessed using the Joanna Briggs Institute Critical Appraisal Checklist for Qualitative Research (76). The scores in relation to the quality appraisal are given in table 2 below.

Table 2. Scores from critical appraisal tool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Critical Appraisal Score (max 10)</th>
<th>Appraisal questions include:</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tim, Cornielje &amp; Edusei, 2011</td>
<td>8</td>
<td>Is there congruity between; the philosophical perspective and research methodology, methodology and questions, methodology and methods, methodology and data analysis, methodology and interpretation of results. A statement locating the researcher and their influence. Are the participant voices</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Wrentschur &amp; Moser, 2014</td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Gurman et al., 2014</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Zuch et al., 2013</td>
<td>6</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walker &amp; Early, 2010, Findholt, Michael &amp; Davis, 2010</td>
<td>5.5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Graham et al., 2013</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kramer et al., 2010</td>
<td>5</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
The quality of the research articles was variable and despite the reported participatory nature of the studies, none of the authors provided a statement of their own positionality, something that is deemed as essential for anti-oppressive work (77) and only Gurman et al., (57) discussed the influence of the researcher on the research. The study by Tijm, Cornielje, & Edusei (59) was the most robust because of its congruence between the philosophical underpinning and methods, including analysis and interpretation of results by co-researchers. In contrast, although Kovacic et al., (46) claimed to be participatory they were directive in relation to the subjects they wanted the participants to photograph. Also, they did not include the co-researchers in the analysis of results which would have strengthened the participatory nature of this project. Notwithstanding the variable quality of the papers, the articles were included in the literature review to provide an overview of the evidence-base available, as they met the inclusion criteria and were pertinent to the research question.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Citation</th>
<th>Participants / location</th>
<th>Occupational Medium</th>
<th>Purpose of article / project</th>
<th>Aspects of transformation/ change described</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 Adams, 2002</td>
<td>Chilean women making ‘arpillera’ in workshops</td>
<td>Arpillera – appliquéd textile images</td>
<td>Reflection on ethnographic research in relation to arpilleras</td>
<td>Authors reflections on the use of visual textile images (arpilleras) in the pro-democracy movement in Chile. Making of arpilleras helped to socialise new recruits into the movement, support solidarity and convey messages to the rest of the world and garner support from the wider community.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2 Benjamin-Thomas et al., 2019</td>
<td>Literature review</td>
<td>Storytelling, video, participatory graphic information systems</td>
<td>Critical methodological review of 20 research articles related to participatory digital methodologies</td>
<td>All projects reviewed had transformative goals. However, authors assert that mostly personal rather than social transformation was found including; increasing sense of belonging, being given space for voices, building self-esteem, consciousness raising and passion for developing social change. Some projects were found to change attitudes and challenge negative stereotypes. Some institutional level changes were reported.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3 Catalani &amp; Minkler, 2010</td>
<td>Literature review</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Literature review to establish a) what defines the photovoice process b) outcomes of photovoice c) how level of participation is related to process and outcomes.</td>
<td>Reviewed 37 articles and evaluated level of participation in photovoice projects from low, moderate to high. Projects that involved higher levels of participation were more likely to include engaging community members in action and advocacy. The authors conclude that photovoice impact at community level has not been well described or assessed.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4 Chan Fung Yi, 2012</td>
<td>Disenfranchised women textile workers in Hong</td>
<td>Quilting</td>
<td>Describes a project to raise awareness and funds for the</td>
<td>Personal transformation described in relation to re-validating identity of women workers to their community and strengthening community networks. This was achieved</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Commented [AW60]: This is comprehensive and may not be required in the journal.

Commented [PN61]: Perhaps you can’t detail these different forms of social change earlier where I have queried this, but you can say that what social change might be about is socioculturally context dependent and because it is research you are examining retrospectively related to the historic demands of the time or ‘situated’, which is why positionality is important.
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Authors</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Methodology</th>
<th>Reflection on Findings</th>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Kong</td>
<td></td>
<td>women’s workers association</td>
<td>through creating ‘the largest quilt in the world’ in a public space. Despite including ‘legislative councillors’ in the public event the author does not discuss any structural changes.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Cooke, Dennison and Gould, 2018</td>
<td>Marginalised communities in South Africa (6-15 yrs) India (9-24 yrs), Brazil – (young women)</td>
<td>Video</td>
<td>Reflection on findings from projects using participatory video, focus on product not process</td>
<td>Change is not discussed in depth as the projects are still ongoing and currently ‘exploring ways to utilise the films to effect change in the lives of participants.’ P271. However, each of the 3 projects were working towards public facing events. In India they plan to show the film to national policy makers, in Brazil the film will go to a community centre. The authors claim personal transformations e.g. increased confidence, empowerment and giving voice but this is not backed up by quotes from participants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Cooke, Dennison and Gould, 2018</td>
<td>Marginalised communities in South Africa (6-15 yrs) India (9-24 yrs), Brazil – (young women)</td>
<td>Video</td>
<td>Reflection on findings from projects using participatory video, focus on product not process</td>
<td>Change is not discussed in depth as the projects are still ongoing and currently ‘exploring ways to utilise the films to effect change in the lives of participants.’ P271. However, each of the 3 projects were working towards public facing events. In India they plan to show the film to national policy makers, in Brazil the film will go to a community centre. The authors claim personal transformations e.g. increased confidence, empowerment and giving voice but this is not backed up by quotes from participants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Cooke, Dennison and Gould, 2018</td>
<td>Marginalised communities in South Africa (6-15 yrs) India (9-24 yrs), Brazil – (young women)</td>
<td>Video</td>
<td>Reflection on findings from projects using participatory video, focus on product not process</td>
<td>Change is not discussed in depth as the projects are still ongoing and currently ‘exploring ways to utilise the films to effect change in the lives of participants.’ P271. However, each of the 3 projects were working towards public facing events. In India they plan to show the film to national policy makers, in Brazil the film will go to a community centre. The authors claim personal transformations e.g. increased confidence, empowerment and giving voice but this is not backed up by quotes from participants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Cooke, Dennison and Gould, 2018</td>
<td>Marginalised communities in South Africa (6-15 yrs) India (9-24 yrs), Brazil – (young women)</td>
<td>Video</td>
<td>Reflection on findings from projects using participatory video, focus on product not process</td>
<td>Change is not discussed in depth as the projects are still ongoing and currently ‘exploring ways to utilise the films to effect change in the lives of participants.’ P271. However, each of the 3 projects were working towards public facing events. In India they plan to show the film to national policy makers, in Brazil the film will go to a community centre. The authors claim personal transformations e.g. increased confidence, empowerment and giving voice but this is not backed up by quotes from participants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Cooke, Dennison and Gould, 2018</td>
<td>Marginalised communities in South Africa (6-15 yrs) India (9-24 yrs), Brazil – (young women)</td>
<td>Video</td>
<td>Reflection on findings from projects using participatory video, focus on product not process</td>
<td>Change is not discussed in depth as the projects are still ongoing and currently ‘exploring ways to utilise the films to effect change in the lives of participants.’ P271. However, each of the 3 projects were working towards public facing events. In India they plan to show the film to national policy makers, in Brazil the film will go to a community centre. The authors claim personal transformations e.g. increased confidence, empowerment and giving voice but this is not backed up by quotes from participants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Cooke, Dennison and Gould, 2018</td>
<td>Marginalised communities in South Africa (6-15 yrs) India (9-24 yrs), Brazil – (young women)</td>
<td>Video</td>
<td>Reflection on findings from projects using participatory video, focus on product not process</td>
<td>Change is not discussed in depth as the projects are still ongoing and currently ‘exploring ways to utilise the films to effect change in the lives of participants.’ P271. However, each of the 3 projects were working towards public facing events. In India they plan to show the film to national policy makers, in Brazil the film will go to a community centre. The authors claim personal transformations e.g. increased confidence, empowerment and giving voice but this is not backed up by quotes from participants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Cooke, Dennison and Gould, 2018</td>
<td>Marginalised communities in South Africa (6-15 yrs) India (9-24 yrs), Brazil – (young women)</td>
<td>Video</td>
<td>Reflection on findings from projects using participatory video, focus on product not process</td>
<td>Change is not discussed in depth as the projects are still ongoing and currently ‘exploring ways to utilise the films to effect change in the lives of participants.’ P271. However, each of the 3 projects were working towards public facing events. In India they plan to show the film to national policy makers, in Brazil the film will go to a community centre. The authors claim personal transformations e.g. increased confidence, empowerment and giving voice but this is not backed up by quotes from participants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Participants/Location</td>
<td>Research Focus</td>
<td>Findings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>----------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Abandoned school in Buenos Aires</td>
<td>Video in a participatory action research project</td>
<td>School dropouts. The methods allowed the participants to give voice, the subsequent video and theatre transcripts made teachers aware of student perspectives and some meso level changes at school were planned.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Graham et al., 2013</td>
<td>9 participants with an average age of 19 from Detroit, USA</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>This photovoice project sought to address violence and its possible solutions in Detroit youth communities. It further intended to generate dialogue and action among youth, community leaders, and policy makers toward violence prevention. Dissemination events held but little description of further action taken.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Gurman et al., 2014</td>
<td>201 participants from a multi-site gender based violence project in South Sudan, Uganda, Thailand, Liberia and Rwanda</td>
<td>Video</td>
<td>Reports a number of positive results in relation to behaviour change and a reduction in violence although authors caution for bias of self-reports. The authors advocate for a multi-level approach and did involve partners (NGOs, workers, men, government) in the projects. Although no real evidence of structural change.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Hergenrather et al., 2009</td>
<td>Literature review</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Identified that methodologies did not always align with participatory nature of photovoice e.g. researchers identified community issues and undertook data analysis. However, 9 studies reported changes in programme or policy, including increasing collaborations and developing a pamphlet. Changes appear to be at micro or meso level.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Hoechner, 2015</td>
<td>12 almajirai boys from Kano, Nigeria</td>
<td>Participatory video</td>
<td>The author is transparent about the aims of the project which were to sensitize the public through the use of film to the issues facing the community and at the same time, using data collected during the production process for academic work. Some personal transformation is acknowledged as is a lack of change at the structural level.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Johnson and Martinez-Guzman, 2013</td>
<td>LGBT group in Brighton, UK and Trans collective in Barcelona, Spain</td>
<td>Photography, storytelling</td>
<td>Reflection on 2 participatory action research projects that aimed to transform dominant forms of representation</td>
<td>Little information provided about personal change but some hints at meso level change e.g. – better access to support services and also the potential of using the narratives as critical testimonies where they hoped to change legislation in Spain.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Johnston, 2016</td>
<td>Literature review</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Scoping review of photovoice to explore how it effects social and policy change</td>
<td>Whilst photovoice has proven effective in engaging people in the political and social lives of their communities, the author concludes from the review that photovoice is most valuable as a vehicle for informing policy rather than for bringing about policy change.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Kovacic et al., 2014</td>
<td>10 African American 8 to 13 year olds from low income households in Detroit, USA</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Research paper – analysis of photovoice project</td>
<td>Project seems to have been a catalyst for developing networks in order to support public health initiatives. However, article individualises problems (eating healthy diets) and does not discuss how to tackle structural determinants.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>16</td>
<td>Kramer et al., 2010</td>
<td>26 adults and 15 youth from low income, ethnically diverse areas of Colorado, USA</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Research paper – analysis of photovoice project as part of wider community projects</td>
<td>Policy leaders were participants in the project. Numerous dissemination activities were held which resulted in a number of policy and environmental changes; including healthier food offerings in schools and restaurants, city planning efforts that emphasize walkability and bikability, access to healthier food, demolition of unsafe buildings, and promotion of youth markets selling fresh produce.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>17</td>
<td>Leung et al., 2017</td>
<td>7 females, 5 males age 11-14 years, East</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Research paper – analysis of photovoice project</td>
<td>Participants able to identify solutions to food justice issues and create a dialogue with peers and family. At the end of the project a celebration and exhibit was held with youth and staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Study</td>
<td>Location</td>
<td>Sample Description</td>
<td>Methodology</td>
<td>Key Findings</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------</td>
<td>----------</td>
<td>--------------------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>Harlem, New York, USA</td>
<td>8 people from a brain injury service 40 – 60 years old, 5 women 3 men in Massachusetts, USA</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Description of how using cameras can be effective in gaining public involvement using 2 case study examples. Photos displayed widely to the public, which may have resulted in attitude changes but no evidence for this. Authors admit no real change to policy as they did not include policy makers in the dissemination.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>19</td>
<td>Homeless individuals in Boston, USA. No numbers given</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Explores homelessness and how visual images can foster social change. This was a service learning project, collaboration between a college and a neighbourhood organisation, involving people who were experiencing homelessness taking photographs and a public exhibition. There were some sustainable outcomes including the original photographers conceiving and planning, a second, expanded exhibition. Student participation in community events increased.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>20</td>
<td>Peruvian grass roots women’s organisations around Lima, Peru</td>
<td>Theatre, street carnivals/parades</td>
<td>Describes how theatre can be a form of grass roots political protest for social change. Describes women’s political protest in Peru using theatre and carnival type street protests. Compelling argument for giving voice, but not for social change. Theatre as a ‘positive, peaceful protest.’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>21</td>
<td>Women asylum seekers in London and North East</td>
<td>Walking, video, forum theatre</td>
<td>Critical discussion of the experiences of women seeking asylum and the use of participatory arts-based methods. These projects brought a feeling of solidarity for the women. Social change was clearly on the agenda in these projects. The challenges of which were given voice by participants and researchers. Researchers ‘hope’ that through engagement with the projects policy makers are inspired to think differently.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>22</td>
<td>6 male and 2 female adult</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>A theoretical and field-based</td>
<td>Reporting of focus group analysis into the experiences of participants involved in a community photography contest.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>participants from a marginalised community in Vancouver</td>
<td>exploration of the urban photography contest ‘Hope in the Shadows.’</td>
<td>Whilst the organisation that runs the contest has social change as an aim the contest itself is said to not be policy motivated, it’s aim is to enable individuals to record their experiences. The author feels the competition gives voice, but the community is still excluded.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td>---</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>23</td>
<td>Sanon, Evans- Agnew &amp; Boutain, 2014</td>
<td>Literature review</td>
<td>Literature review to analyse the social justice impact of photovoice projects</td>
<td>Maps the research impacts using a framework of social justice awareness, amelioration and transformation.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>24</td>
<td>Spiegel &amp; Parent, 2018</td>
<td>Personal transformation was evidenced as was the growth of social networks and feelings of community connectedness for the participants. Authors question how much structural change is achieved or whether the programmes serve to reinforce the status-quo.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>25</td>
<td>Spiegel et al., 2019</td>
<td>Government initiated national project, large scale evaluation. Does address personal transformation. Identifies the conflicting driver of economic change in relation to the circus making participants more work ready (individual skill development) versus a focus on general improvement to community and ‘Buen Vivir’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>26</td>
<td>Tijm, Cornielje and Edusei, 2011</td>
<td>This project gave people voice and opportunity to disseminate needs to stakeholders but it is not clear if any further action came of it.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>27</td>
<td>Walker and Early, 2010</td>
<td>This project focused on people who work with the disadvantaged community. Transparent table of actions developed; some for the organisation that the participants worked for and some for government. The organisation made</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Authors</td>
<td>Participants</td>
<td>Method</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Summary</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>---</td>
<td>-----------------------</td>
<td>--------------</td>
<td>--------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>28</td>
<td>Wang et al., 2004</td>
<td>41 youths and adults including policy makers, Flint, USA</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Descriptive field report of a photovoice project</td>
<td>Description of a project designed to identify community assets and concerns. An innovation was including policy makers as participants. Photovoice project said to have been instrumental in competition for a Youth Violence Prevention Centre and renewal of funding for programmes.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>29</td>
<td>Wood, 2016</td>
<td>61 school young people and 6 teachers from a failing school in New Zealand</td>
<td>Photography and digital storytelling</td>
<td>Reflections on a photovoice and digital story project designed to counter social exclusion.</td>
<td>The author did not feel that the main goal of celebrating the young people’s strengths and changing attitudes within the town was note achieved. A dissemination event was cancelled by the local council which was perceived to be too risky, which ultimately compounded attitudes of failure.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>30</td>
<td>Wrentschur and Moser, 2014</td>
<td>23 Disadvantaged young people (16-24 years) unemployed in Austria. 16 performances, 1000 people involved overall.</td>
<td>Theatre</td>
<td>Research paper – analysis of a forum theatre project</td>
<td>Used Forum theatre to try and bridge the gap between the youth and policy makers and to strengthen partnerships. Partners invited to rehearsals early on including NGOs and government departments. Audiences discussed problem solving strategies and notes were made of proposals. Recommendations were and will continue to be discussed with stakeholders /decision makers. Sounds like there was commitment for policy change from stakeholders to the extent that recommendations are published in a booklet.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>31</td>
<td>Zuch et al., 2013</td>
<td>8 School children South Africa</td>
<td>Photography</td>
<td>Research paper - analysis of a photovoice project</td>
<td>A photovoice project to combat violence at school. With 8 children from 1 school in South Africa. Personal agency was experienced by participants but authors admit to no lasting change.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Findings

The literature has been synthesised into three broad themes and a number of subthemes by the first author, using Nvivo software to support the analysis. The themes relate to the use of arts-based practices for enacting social transformation for people who experience injustices and are: personal transformation and giving voice; aspirations towards social transformation; and using occupations for social change. The themes and subthemes are described in Table 3 below:

Table 3. Synthesis of literature into themes and subthemes.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Personal Transformation and Giving Voice</th>
<th>Aspirations Towards Social Transformation</th>
<th>Using Occupations for Social Change</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Personal transformations</td>
<td>Lack of change</td>
<td>Benefits of creative methods</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The experience of giving voice</td>
<td>Actions at the meso level</td>
<td>Lasting artefacts for change</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Making voices heard to others</td>
<td>Enhancing social capital and changing attitudes</td>
<td>Risks in using arts-based practices</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Personal transformation and giving voice

Personal transformations

The majority of the articles asserted participants experienced personal change in some way as a result of involvement with the projects or research (42-44, 53, 54, 56, 58-62, 65, 66, 68, 72). Disappointingly, for projects based on a participatory ethos, this assertion was not always supported with evidence from the participants (46, 72).
Additionally, there was a lack of discussion about mechanisms that brought this change about. However, aspects of personal transformation reported were; increased confidence (42, 47, 54, 59, 62, 66), increased political awareness (56, 62, 66, 68, 72) and increased sense of empowerment (58, 61, 63, 66, 68). Empowerment was not universally reported however. In one study, the use of photovoice resulted in a painful examination of feelings to the extent that one participant stated they would not participate in photovoice again (64). Additionally, Catalani and Minkler (68) found that enhanced empowerment was not reported in photovoice studies where participants were not included in all aspects of the research process.

The experience of giving voice

Personal validation through opportunities to ‘give voice’ to participants concerns in the wider public domain was a feature of many articles (42, 46, 47, 49, 52, 56, 58, 61-63, 66, 69, 72). In one study, the authors asserted that children were pleased that people outside of their community cared about them (46) whilst in another, during a walking interview with a migrant mother, the participant felt accepted because the researcher listened to her story (65). In Chile, textile art-works known as ‘arpilleras’ were exported to raise financial support to women living in shantytowns but also served as media to garner support from international human rights organisations. It appeared that ‘giving voice’ was particularly important in situations where participants were able to share their stories with policy makers or government officials—for example, in the study by Wrentschur and Moser (66), the youth presented to the Austrian Minister for Social Affairs and the Head of the Austrian Employment Service. In Chan’s (56) study, one of the participants voiced that she could have ‘never imagined’ having Legislative Councillors attend the project. However, supporting participants to give voice to those...
perceived as powerful could have unintended outcomes. For example, in Hoechner’s article (61) the State Commissioner attended the dissemination event, which fuelled rumours in the community, of financial inducements being made.

Giving voice is a complex phenomenon due to the embedded nature of communities in long standing socio-cultural and political histories. Despite the stated aims of giving voice using methods like photovoice (73) this did not necessarily follow in all of the literature reviewed. In a photovoice project to combat violence at school, Zuch et al., (58) found that whilst children did voice their concerns about sexual violence in focus groups, they declined to raise this at a dissemination event as they felt they may be judged negatively by the adults attending. In the same study, some stakeholders were dismissive of the children’s claims generally about violence at school, which impacted on the children’s sense of agency (58). Interestingly, other ‘silences’ were reported in some of the articles (45, 61). Frey and Cross (45) initially planned to focus on school abandonment in their project, however, they had to change direction to ‘youth rights’ in order for youth to want to participate. On reflection the authors felt that school abandonment was not an irrelevant issue to their participants but one that was avoided as it may lead to self-blame (45). Similarly, the Almajirai boys in Hoechner’s study had previously been respected in their community but in recent times, they had become stigmatised and reviled. Consequently, the boys developed an alternative discourse to describe their deprived living situation, articulating their situation was an active choice necessary for their religious learning, which served to protect them from shameful feelings associated with their poverty (61).
Making voices heard to others

There were a considerable variety of public facing events undertaken as a result of the arts-based projects, for example photographic exhibitions, theatrical performances and even the public stitching together of a quilt. Appeals and even protests were made to the public and policy makers, suggesting that the projects were able to achieve some of their claims to advocacy. The reach of some public facing events was limited to local community centres (44, 46, 48) which are places where arguably, audiences may already be knowledgeable of the issues raised. Other articles report efforts at making voices heard at high level committees, for example the All Party Parliamentary Group on Migration at the House of Commons (65). Projects attracted local government officials (51, 53, 55, 59, 61, 66) the press (51, 53, 55, 56, 59) and universities (46, 52, 59, 61). In one example, the local press published an article about the study by Findholt, Michael & Davis (51) which led the participants to undertake many other public speaking events. Large displays in public spaces were also evident, in Hong Kong, the women laid out and pieced together their giant quilt in a public square bordered by enterprises that may have profited, in the past, from their labour (56). In Lima, Peru, women protestors took their theatre directly outside the Government Palace using parody to voice what might normally have been impossible to say (42).

Aspirations towards social transformation

Lack of change

Despite intentions towards socially transformative practice, many of the articles were unable to confirm organisational or structural level changes. This was evident in the critical methodological review (72) and in the individual articles discussed here.
Hoechner (61) was categorical that despite the intention, her film project did nothing to address structural inequality. In another example of a project designed to reduce violence in school, the authors suggested that teachers and children were not confident of lasting change (58). No agreed action was taken at the six week follow up, despite the Principal attending the final dissemination meeting and committing to taking forward some plans (58). Time may have been an issue as transformative processes may occur over the longer-term (43, 69, 71). For example, in a multi-site study that intended to help effect change in the lives of marginalised communities (44) the authors suggested that it was too early to tell whether higher level change had occurred. In a reflection on a digital storytelling project Wood (62) reported on a participatory project with a ‘failing’ school which aspired to social change through challenging perceptions of failure and ‘good’ and ‘bad’ schools/communities. The participants were marginalised children, of Maori decent, who created digital stories through the photovoice method to celebrate their strengths, which were to be shared with their town through a street festival. Unfortunately, the council removed its backing for the festival at the last minute due to perceptions of risk, which reinforced historic prejudices, potentially strengthening notions of failure (62). As Wood (62) asserts, historically embedded social exclusion would require more than a six month project to be transformed.

There were examples where placing responsibility for change on the individuals experiencing the injustices would benefit from further critique. For example, photovoice was employed in Zuch et al., (58) study to empower students. However, the authors write that in their dissemination event, stakeholders agreed that school violence problems began in the home and socio-structural factors needed to be addressed beyond the school, but did not offer action plans for this. Additionally, in the study by...
Kovacic et al., (46) which explored the perceptions of youth on how the environment influences health, the authors begin their project by providing definitions of health to the children. The definition appears to individualise health as ‘one’s own potential with respect to body, heart, mind, and spirit’ (46) despite evidence of the influence of broader social determinants (2). Also, the authors acknowledge that many of the children had low literacy levels and had to adapt their research method to accommodate this but this is not problematised in relation to the children’s future educational aspirations.

In other examples, where participants had been able to give voice to policy makers or government officials, there was a lack of evidence for these practices bringing about change. In Peru, women participated in street performances protesting against the corrupt government, but Moser (42) felt that change was probably not due specifically to the women’s actions but may have been part of a general movement towards change. Additionally, although asylum seeking women in the United Kingdom were able to present at an All Party Parliamentary Group on Migration at the House of Commons, the project authors, Erel, Reynolds & Kaptani, (63) theorised about the potential for socially transformative change rather than providing evidence of it. A number of the studies reported that participants generated a list of possible solutions to problems that were being addressed (45, 48, 53, 60, 71). In Walker and Early’s article (60) recommendations were made for the participating organisation and some for government, but there was no discussion as to how government actions would be taken up. Equally, solutions to food justice problems were generated by the children in Leung et als., (48) photovoice study but a lack of longer-term impact was cited as a limitation of the study. Finally, in Lorenz and Kolb’s (47) article they admit that no action was taken as a result of the study but also that they did not involve policy makers in the
Overall, there was an evident lack of follow-up in some of these studies, which was echoed in Benjamin-Thomas et al., (72) critical review [2].

**Actions at the meso level**

Although more limited in number than personal transformations, there were some promising examples in the literature of socially transformative practice extended beyond individuals, to institutional or community changes (53, 55, 64, 68, 69, 71, 72). Changes included enhanced city plans to increase walkability and bikability, (53), development of a youth violence prevention centre (55), and using video to promote better accessibility to support services (64). In the review of participatory digital methodologies by Benjamin-Thomas et al., (72) a number of institutional changes were reported including the development of a farmers market at a school to reduce food insecurity (78) and creating a non-profit organisation (79).

Unfortunately, the trigger factors for change were not articulated in the articles. In Sanon, Evans-Agnew & Boutain’s, (69) literature review of photovoice, 11 studies reported on immediate action for change with three making significant changes including the passage of a state law, renovating a park and building of a grocery store. Despite these examples they assert that most change occurred at the individual level (69). In a similar review by Catalani and Minkler (68) 60% of projects lead to action. However, this was more evident in longer-term projects that included greater degrees of participation and community building efforts.

**Enhancing social capital and changing attitudes**

In addition to the above mentioned transformations, there were a number of examples of enhanced social capital as a result of the projects. Although there are numerous definitions of social capital (80) the term is used here to denote enhanced
networks or relationships and a reduction in isolation. The large-scale quilting project reported in Chan Fung Yi’s (56) paper brought previously isolated women together into a community. For example, one of the participants is quoted as saying ‘when spreading out the big quilt...wow! Our power and vigour are stronger than when we do our (normal, salaried) work!’ (56). This sense of solidarity and shared experience was evident elsewhere in other projects (63, 65, 66, 72). Raising awareness of issues for marginalised groups and attitude change was as potential outcome discussed in a number of projects (45, 49-51, 57, 61, 69) although in Gurman et al.’s (57) study the authors caution against positive results in attitude change as many of the outcomes were self-reported and could be biased. In Robinson’s (49) study photographs were used to counter negative assumptions made by ‘outsiders’ about the community; although Robinson concludes that the community remains excluded. In Chan Fung Yi (56) description of the quilting project, a competition was run alongside the quilting project, involving 20 schools and approximately 280 children in making patches for the quilt, dedicated to the women textile workers, which could potentially further shift attitude change (56). Another project using photovoice raised awareness of issues affecting school abandonment that had been previously been overlooked by teaching staff (45).

Using occupations for social change

Benefits of creative methods

A range of diverse occupational mediums were used throughout the literature to support social change, although photography and photovoice were in the majority in this review (46-53, 55, 58-60, 62, 64, 68-71). Other mediums included video (44, 45, 57, 61, 65, 72) theatre and carnival (42, 45, 63, 65, 66) storytelling (64, 72) quilting (56) textile
images (37) and circus arts (43, 54). Special mention should be given to the article by Spiegel et al., (43) as this describes an unprecedented national social circus project initiated by the Government of Ecuador. The project was designed as a social intervention to use circus arts with youth and marginalised groups across the country with the aim of enacting the Government’s commitment to the policy of ‘Buen Vivir’, which emphasises community well-being over economic indicators (43). The underpinning philosophy is that collective risk taking and creativity developed using circus arts by marginalised groups will lead to social transformations. The inherent playfulness and creativity in circus arts was reported as a medium for re-learning relationships within groups and the physical aspects supported the development of trust (54).

The occupational mediums provided participants with a safe space to explore issues pertinent to them that might not otherwise be achieved with more formal discussions (44, 45, 61, 65, 66). The use of theatre had particular power in this regard. The young people in Frey and Cross’ (45) study dramatized ‘putting their school on trial’ to explore the schools role in causing student drop-outs. This gave participants opportunities to question school practices and avoid unhelpful self-blame. Some studies used more formalised ‘forum theatre’ (63, 66). The participants were able to enact scenes relating to the personal experiences, which allowed participants to try out different ways of engaging. This was a welcomed strategy in Erel, Reynolds and Kaptani’s (63) study, one migrant mother commented that after role playing a scene trying to access a GP that ‘I felt before I didn’t know nothing, I didn’t know what was going to happen if you have children, (…) if you go to GP (…) [at the workshops] I got different ideas’ (63). If forum theatre is extended to wider audiences, spectators are encouraged to become ‘spect-actors’ and collectively brainstorm alternative solutions.
Forum theatre was felt to allow different knowledge’s to surface and challenged more conventional research as the basis of truth.

There was evidence of additional benefits in the creative methods adopted, partly in terms of supporting alternative communication forms, for example with socially excluded youth, where workshops and writing tasks reinforced feelings of failure in relation to school drop-out, dramatisation and use of video supported engagement and communication between participants and researchers. Creative methods were also felt to amplify participants voices and the novelty and visual impact of photography helped to raise visibility amongst other competing priorities for action. In the case of Kramer et al., the authors suggest that photovoice acted as a catalyst for action in the community, although the authors do not elaborate on why or how photovoice was effective.

**Lasting artefacts for change**

Arts-based interventions for social change can result in the production of tangible artefacts like photographs, videos or giant quilts. A participant in one study felt that photographs were able to tell truths that would counter negative media reporting about their community. In a similar fashion, textile images were made and distributed globally to spread information about the reality of the Pinochet regime in Chile with the textiles allowing the makers to remain anonymous.

In other cases, artefacts were then used and re-used to further social causes in a wider variety of ways. However, this was not possible with ‘one off’ theatre productions and unfortunately in Wood’s study the digital stories were lost due to computer error. Two authors did not report on further use of the artefacts. There were also potential long lasting ethical issues in relation to anonymity and confidentiality with visual images as participants situations may change and they...
may no longer relate to their previous experiences, as was the case for some participants in Johnson and Martínez Guzmán (64) study.

Some of the occupational mediums used had particular cultural meaning for the participants, for example, the quilting project gave the ex-textile workers from Hong Kong an opportunity to re-validate their skills in the public domain (56) whilst the women in Peru harnessed traditional forms of carnival to make their protest (42). However, selection of the occupational medium needs careful thought as an example from Cooke, Dennison & Gould, (44) shows; using performance and participatory video in India, with a group who historically were nomadic street performers limited the value of the message because of long standing cultural assumptions about performers as undesirables. Contrary to this, the use of film making as a modern technological method in Hoechner’s study (61) successfully altered the perceptions of marginalised youth amongst the middle and upper class audience they aimed at reaching.

Risks in using arts-based practices

There were risks inherent in the occupational processes described in the articles. The Chilean women making arpilleras had to work in a clandestine fashion, meeting in secret and hiding their work in their skirts so as not to be discovered (37). Photography and participatory video were problematic in some instances. The use of video means protecting identities was problematic, which concerned one young actor playing the role of a thief in a participatory video. He was anxious that members of his community may not be able to tell fact from fiction leading to further stigmatisation (61). In another example, in the school based study about violence, the children participating reported that they were hated by other children for shedding light on what happens at school (58). Some of the parents were also concerned for their children’s safety when
participating [58]. In addition, carrying video equipment or cameras put participants at risk if they were perceived to be valuable by others, or if there was suspicion at the motives of the participants for taking photographs, as was the case in Tijm, Cornielje and Edusei’s study [59].

Discussion

This literature review systematically searched for XXX and subsequently synthesised a total of 31 articles to illuminate how arts-based practices can be used to bring about social transformation for people who are marginalised. Reflecting on the research question, it is evident that there were varying degrees of success in relation to the projects and the change derived. Personal transformations for project participants were reported in many of the articles, however, change beyond the individual was more limited.

The social justice framework, first described by Boutain (81), is a useful framework for understanding the levels of change achieved beyond the individual. The framework includes the concepts of social justice awareness, amelioration and transformation. Awareness relates to the process of participants, researchers and audiences developing new understandings of power and systems of oppression (69) in relation to their situation. In this review, many articles reported social justice awareness which relates to those instances where participants gained increased political awareness, critical consciousness or where attitudes changed about participants or their situations. Opportunities for participants to give voice to their life conditions also enhanced social justice awareness. Giving voice included dissemination of participants’ views to ‘outsiders’, those in their wider community or policy makers and others with power. Two of the articles in this review suggested that giving voice to a marginalised...
community may be ‘enough’, a worthwhile pursuit in its own right without further change occurring [42, 47]. The implication for practitioners is that raising social justice awareness is [sufficient]. However, this was the opinion of the authors and not substantiated by voices of the participants. Assumptions like these would benefit from further ethical exploration; is raising awareness of unjust conditions really sufficient? Arguably, responsible occupation-based practitioners need to both highlight and challenge structural [inequalities] Prevailing neoliberal discourses which place blame on individuals for their living situations serve to conceal from public view the structural factors that influence injustices [45, 61].

Social justice amelioration describes a situation where action is taken to meet immediate concerns in the short-term (81). There were examples of social justice amelioration in this review where changes within institutional practices or community developments were made, such as renovating parks, establishing not-for-profit organisations and development of student/teacher committees in [schools]. Crucially, amelioration does not really change the conditions that repeatedly create injustices. Johnston (70) argues that approaches like photovoice can be used to inform policy but raising expectations of policy change might lead to false hopes. Whilst there maybe merit in developing short-term meso level solutions, the danger is that these actions do not shift the status-quo and lead to the reproduction of injustices. Those in privileged positions develop solutions to ‘help’ but ultimately, continue to retain power over those that are ‘needy’. Critically, establishing ‘worthy’ projects may unintentionally shift focus away from pervasive inequalities, depoliticising injustices (54). This appeared to be the case in many of the studies under review. In the social circus example, the authors did not report changes in the living conditions for marginalised groups (43). The focus of some of the social circus projects shifted to using circus occupations to help
participants enhance individual skills and employability at the expense of focusing on community social well-being (43). In using arts-based occupations to bring about ameliorative change to conditions, practitioners will also need to ensure that they highlight and challenge the structural conditions that give rise to, and perpetuate, these conditions.

According to Boutain (81) social justice transformation is devoted to redressing unjust conditions by changing structures using long range systematic solutions. This would necessitate change at a national policy or legislative level and there were no examples of this in the literature reviewed. However, in one of the articles reviewed by Sanon, Evans-Agnew & Boutain (69) a new state law was established which demonstrates legislative change, albeit at a localised level. As Wood (62) asserts historical injustices require long-term system change to transform them. Revolutionary movements seek large scale structural changes that challenge established power bases (82). For occupation-based practitioners a call for revolution might be beyond their abilities or will. An alternative strategy for social change, espoused in some social movements, is a process of piecemeal change adopted by activists who work within systems for short-term gains hoping for longer-term improvements (82). This may be the realistic way forward for those who have ambitions to work towards the alleviation of social injustices, although practitioners need to mindful of reproducing inequalities through….

The research question underpinning this review also sought to establish how occupation-based practices might lead to social transformation. The findings suggest that using art forms like photography, theatre, film and textile arts might support the development of social justice awareness and amelioration but the underlying mechanisms of how this change actually comes about is less apparent. Some key

Commented [PN148]: Yes, so in revolutionary political theory, the social circus is a diversion, a typical action of government. Outside of that a 2006 Joseph Rowntree report on community initiatives (Kapasi?) pointed out that potential participants understand well enough that a project is not going to do much, and gauge their participation accordingly. They go along with it, and get what they can, but they do not expect the benefits to last – so how good are the claims to social change?

Commented [PN149]: The problem here is that none of the actions by themselves will produce social change. This is what I mean by lighting some fires. However, you might set off some that led to others led by other people and a cumulative effect occurs. The theory has to be seen from a historical perspective, in my view, that of the 600 year old class war which has continued since the end of the feudal era, about 1450. In this there have been gains and losses, mostly losses in the last 40 years of neoliberalism. Social change is not something that can happen in 3 years or 6 months, but over a longer period of time. But that perspective is not married up to OT, and OT does not, by and large, recognise a historical process (though there is some discussion of this in Latin American OT, contextualising the profession against a historical process of colonialism, imperialism and capitalism). I’ll leave this in although I think you address it in the next para!

Commented [AW150]: You say no but then give an example.

Commented [AW151]: Explain term or is this a direct quote.

Commented [AW152]: Factors?

Commented [SA153]: See my comment above regarding the change theme.
features were that using arts-based occupations provided a ‘safe space’ to discuss and critique injustices, visual representations appeared to be powerful ways of communicating although there were positives and negatives in relation to concealing identities depending on the medium used.

There were only a small percentage of articles reviewed (n=5) that reported on the use of arts for social change or transformation, that were not initiated as a research project. It is possible that re-running the literature search in a broader range of databases with further development of search terms may uncover more articles that report on the use of occupations for social transformation. Equally, it is possible that knowledge around the use of occupations for social change may not be reported in academic journals without an accompanying research evaluation, particularly as ‘peer review’ was an inclusion criteria in this literature review. Knowledge of change processes is likely to be tacit, learned in the field, and not necessarily reported in academic journals. Additionally, there was a quietness in the literature in relation to project participants’ knowledge of change. While their expertise in projects was reported in terms of the pertinent issues they faced, their understanding of how changes might occur was not given space. This is an omission given that participatory approaches are claimed as empowering people at grass roots to create change.

This literature review has added to the knowledge base in relation to understanding the types of socially transformative outcomes that might be achievable by using arts-based methods. The review does not however, provide sufficient detail in relation to how the change occurs; causation has not been given space in this literature. More work is required therefore, to be able to help achieve the ambitions of the International Social Transformation through Occupation Network in creating strategies for occupation-based social transformation (13). Hocking has suggested that exploring

Commented [AW154]: Also other negative outcomes.

Commented [AW155]: Is this more to do with what gets published? Answered later.

Commented [SA156]: Do you really think this? Did you make your search as thorough as possible in your view?

Commented [PN157R156]: I think that one of the issues to discuss is how you link this to social transformation – because outside of OT there are other disciplines who have used the arts to communicate public health messages (could that be social change?) and there is a long tradition of arts for social change in a lay sense and even longer in the religious sense, as well as a similar tradition of arts in the form of pomp and ceremony to uphold the status quo (e.g. medieval pageants around coronations or royal processions in the Tudor period – so there is a long history, of this kind of activity, it is not wholly new. You might not have room to deal with all that here though.

Commented [PN158]: So was it even considered?

Commented [AW159]: Can you support with reference from PAR?
diverse ontologies might be beneficial in occupational science (33) and the critical realist approach may have value in furthering understanding of occupation-based social transformation. Critical realism advocates a model of generative causation (83). This model supports researchers to identify mechanisms that might operate to produce certain outcomes in particular contexts, rather than proposing linear causation where x causes y, which is typical of positivism (84), or focusing on interpretation and description which are advocated in constructivism (85). Therefore, a critical realist approach could have merit in uncovering how using occupation-based practices with communities might bring about socially transformative outcomes.

Limitations
Findings from the current review must be considered with regards to a number of limitations. Only studies written in English were included, potentially excluding valuable information in other languages. Although systematic searches were undertaken and rigorous processes followed, the articles selected for review were chosen by the lead author alone, therefore limiting the rigor of the review. The narrative synthesis is both a potential strength and weakness of this review; it permitted a comprehensive integration of a broad range of studies, however it is limited to the authors' subjective interpretation which may lack transparency.

Acknowledgements
The lead author would like to thank her research supervisors for their support, direction and invaluable advice in the creation of this article.

Commented [AW160]: This is leading nicely to possible use of PAR and critical realist approaches.

Commented [AW161]: Possibly not needed as we will be co-authors.
References


